

FINAL AWARD ALLOWING COMPENSATION
(Affirming Award and Decision of Administrative Law Judge
by Supplemental Opinion)

Injury No.: 03-112481

Employee: Rosalind Hawkins
Employer: American Airlines
Insurer: American Home Assurance
Additional Party: Treasurer of Missouri as Custodian
of Second Injury Fund (Open)

The above-entitled workers' compensation case is submitted to the Labor and Industrial Relations Commission (Commission) for review as provided by § 287.480 RSMo. Having reviewed the evidence, read the briefs, and considered the whole record, the Commission finds that the award of the administrative law judge is supported by competent and substantial evidence and was made in accordance with the Missouri Workers' Compensation Law. Pursuant to § 286.090 RSMo, the Commission affirms the award and decision of the administrative law judge dated October 19, 2009, as supplemented herein.

Preliminaries

The administrative law judge found that, as a result of the accident on June 15, 2003, employee sustained a 40% permanent partial disability of the right shoulder at the 232 week level for 92.8 weeks at \$340.12 a week for a total of \$31,563.14 as compensation for permanent partial disability. Further, the administrative law judge found that employee will not benefit from and is not entitled to any future medical care.

Although the Commission agrees with the administrative law judge's conclusion, it is not clear from the award exactly how the administrative law judge arrived at an award of 40% permanent partial disability. For this reason, we provide the following supplementation.

Findings of Fact

The stipulations of the parties were accurately recounted in the award of the administrative law judge and are adopted by the Commission.

Employee worked for TWA/American Airlines (employer) for 36 years. When she last worked for employer she was a Flight Service Manager/Purser. On June 15, 2003, employee was standing next to the cockpit door and her arm was caught between the parts of the bi-fold door. Later that day, on a different flight, a similar occurrence took place. The captain pushed the bi-fold door open several times. Employee's right arm was again pinched in the folds of the bi-fold door.

Employee: Rosalind Hawkins

- 2 -

When employee returned from her trip, she went to in-flight services and was sent for treatment. When she was seen at Barnes Care, employee had a significant amount of pain in the elbow and shoulder.

On September 24, 2003, Dr. Haupt performed surgery on employee's right shoulder and an arthroscopic intraarticular debridement of partial thickness rotator cuff tear, and excision of the CA ligament and distal clavicle excision. After surgery, Dr. Haupt had employee follow up with physical therapy and tried to increase her activities. On December 1, 2003, Dr. Haupt released employee to work with the following restrictions: no lifting greater than 15 lbs from the floor to knuckle level; no lifting greater than 10 lbs from knuckle level to shoulder level; and no lifting of any weight above shoulder level. Dr. Haupt did not think that employee could return to her previous work as a flight attendant with lifting and pushing unless someone was there to help her.

Employee next went to see Dr. James Walentynowicz, who diagnosed employee with ongoing adhesive capsulitis and recommended re-manipulation of the shoulder. Employee then went to see Dr. Zehnder, who after examining employee, felt that she was at maximum medical improvement and needed no further treatment.

Employee then treated with Dr. Miller, who felt that employee had a postoperative frozen shoulder. Dr. Miller ordered an MRI Arthrogram. After reviewing the MRI, Dr. Miller felt employee had partial thickness rotator cuff tears that were damaged enough that there would likely be some permanent weakness. Dr. Miller opined that employee could be treated conservatively.

On January 18, 2005, employee was seen by Dr. Emanuel for an Independent Medical Evaluation (IME). Dr. Emanuel diagnosed employee with right shoulder pain, partial thickness rotator cuff tear, with possible focal full thickness rotator cuff tear, early degeneration of the glenohumeral joint, status post arthroscopic debridement of glenoid labrum and rotator cuff tear. Dr. Emanuel recommended the following restrictions: no lifting more than 10 lbs. from floor to waist level; no lifting of any weight from waist level to shoulder level; no pushing or pulling more than 25 lbs. on a four wheel cart; no pushing or pulling more than 10 lbs. if the weight is not on a cart; and no repetitive use of the shoulder. Dr. Emanuel testified that he believes that, as a result of the June 15, 2003, injury, employee's upper right extremity is 5 – 7.5% permanently partially disabled at the level of the shoulder.

Employee was also seen by Dr. Volarich for the purpose of an IME. Dr. Volarich found that as a result of employee's injury on June 15, 2003, she had right shoulder internal derangement, S/P arthroscopic subacromial decompression, excision of the coracoacromial ligament, acromioplasty, distal clavicle excision as well as debridement of the labrum and partial thickness rotator cuff tear. Dr. Volarich opined that employee's injury caused a 50% permanent partial disability of the right upper extremity at the shoulder as well as 20% permanent partial disability of the right upper extremity at the elbow due to a contusion. Dr. Volarich testified that employee is at maximum medical improvement and is not in need of future medical care.

Employee: Rosalind Hawkins

- 3 -

Employee testified that she is right arm dominant. Employee stated that as a result of the injury she is unable to return to work as a flight attendant. Employee stated that she can lift a gallon of milk and her dog with her right arm, but she does not believe she can lift more than 8 lbs. One of employee's hobbies was playing the piano, but after this injury she is no longer able to even play a full piece. She stated that her shoulder is never comfortable and that her pain increases with increased activity. Employee testified that she cannot lift anything with her arm extended and that it is very difficult for her to dress herself. Employee claims that her pain is never below a 6 on a scale of 1 – 10 and that she has passed out 14 times due to the pain. Employee also stated that she cannot tolerate for her elbow to be touched.

Conclusions of Law

In light of the parties' stipulations, there is no dispute that employee sustained an accidental injury on June 15, 2003, while in the course and scope of employment with employer. Therefore, the only real issue concerns nature and extent of employee's permanent partial disability.

Dr. Volarich rated employee at 50% permanent partial disability of the right upper extremity at the shoulder as well as 20% permanent partial disability of the right upper extremity at the elbow due to a contusion. On the other hand, Dr. Emanuel testified that he believes employee's permanent partial disability of the right upper extremity at the shoulder is between 5 – 7.5%.

We find, as did the administrative law judge, that 5 – 7.5% permanent partial disability is not an accurate rating considering employee's aforementioned restrictions and current complaints. And while we find that Dr. Volarich's rating of 50% permanent partial disability of the right upper extremity at the shoulder is more persuasive than Dr. Emanuel's rating, we also find, in considering the record as a whole, that Dr. Volarich's rating is slightly overstated. Lastly, we find that while employee subjectively complains of problems with her elbow, the objective medical findings do not support an award of permanent partial disability with respect to her elbow.

We find, as did the administrative law judge, that although neither doctors' ratings of permanent partial disability for employee's right shoulder are fully supported by the record, Dr. Volarich's rating is more persuasive than Dr. Emanuel's. Therefore, we agree with the administrative law judge and find that employee is 40% permanently partially disabled of the right shoulder. We also find, as did the administrative law judge, that employee did not suffer permanent partial disability for her elbow. In addition, we find that employee will not benefit from, and is not entitled to, any future medical care.

The award and decision of Administrative Law Judge Cornelius T. Lane, issued October 19, 2009, is affirmed, and is attached and incorporated by this reference.

Employee: Rosalind Hawkins

- 4 -

The Commission further approves and affirms the administrative law judge's allowance of attorney's fees herein as being fair and reasonable.

Any past due compensation shall bear interest as provided by law.

Given at Jefferson City, State of Missouri, this 20th day of July 2010.

LABOR AND INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS COMMISSION

William F. Ringer, Chairman

Alice A. Bartlett, Member

John J. Hickey, Member

Attest:

Secretary

AWARD

Employee:	Rosalind Hawkins	Injury No.:	03-112481
Dependents:	N/A		Before the
Employer:	American Airlines		Division of Workers'
Additional Party:	Second Injury Fund		Compensation
Insurer:	American Home Assurance		Department of Labor and Industrial
Hearing Date:	August 24, 2009		Relations of Missouri
			Jefferson City, Missouri
		Checked by:	CTL:dwp

FINDINGS OF FACT AND RULINGS OF LAW

1. Are any benefits awarded herein? Yes
2. Was the injury or occupational disease compensable under Chapter 287? Yes
3. Was there an accident or incident of occupational disease under the Law? Yes
4. Date of accident or onset of occupational disease: June 15, 2003
5. State location where accident occurred or occupational disease was contracted: Missouri
6. Was above employee in employ of above employer at time of alleged accident or occupational disease? Yes
7. Did employer receive proper notice? Yes
8. Did accident or occupational disease arise out of and in the course of the employment? Yes
9. Was claim for compensation filed within time required by Law? Yes
10. Was employer insured by above insurer? Yes
11. Describe work employee was doing and how accident occurred or occupational disease contracted:
Claimant was struck in the right shoulder and arm by a cockpit door.
12. Did accident or occupational disease cause death? No
13. Part(s) of body injured by accident or occupational disease: Right shoulder
14. Nature and extent of any permanent disability: 40% of the right shoulder at the 232 week level
15. Compensation paid to-date for temporary disability: \$14,904.00
16. Value necessary medical aid paid to date by employer/insurer? \$31,355.17

Employee: Rosalind Hawkins

Injury No.: 03-112481

17. Value necessary medical aid not furnished by employer/insurer? None
18. Employee's average weekly wages: \$928.00
19. Weekly compensation rate: \$628.67/\$340.12
20. Method wages computation: By agreement

COMPENSATION PAYABLE

21. Amount of compensation payable: 40% right shoulder for a total of \$31,563.14
22. Second Injury Fund liability: Open

TOTAL: \$31, 563.14

23. Future requirements awarded: None

Said payments to begin and to be payable and be subject to modification and review as provided by law.

The compensation awarded to the claimant shall be subject to a lien in the amount of 25% of all payments hereunder in favor of the following attorney for necessary legal services rendered to the claimant: Daniel Gauthier 7777 Bonhomme Ave, Suite 2250, Clayton, Missouri 63105

FINDINGS OF FACT and RULINGS OF LAW:

Employee:	Rosalind Hawkins	Injury No.: 03-112481
Dependents:	N/A	Before the
Employer:	American Airlines	Division of Workers'
Additional Party:	Second Injury Fund	Compensation
Insurer:	American Home Assurance	Department of Labor and Industrial
Hearing Date:	August 24, 2009	Relations of Missouri
		Jefferson City, Missouri
		Checked by: CTL:dwp

PRELIMINARIES

A hearing was held in the above-mentioned matter on August 24, 2009. Rosalind Hawkins ("Claimant") was represented by Daniel J. Gauthier. American Airlines ("Employer") and its insurer American Home Assurance Company ("Insurer") were represented Attorney Benjamin Shelledy.

STIPULATIONS

1. Claimant was an employee of Employer on June 15, 2003, when she sustained an accidental injury.
2. Claimant was in the course and scope of employment with Employer, who received proper notice of the injury.

ISSUES

1. What is the nature and extent of permanent partial disability?
2. Is there a need for future medical benefits?

EXHIBITS

Claimant submitted the following exhibits for hearing:

Exhibit A:	Deposition of Dr. David T. Volarich taken on March 13, 2009
Exhibit B:	Dr. David T. Volarich's Curriculum Vitae
Exhibit C:	Dr. David T. Volarich's Medical Report
Exhibit D:	Medical Records from the Orthopedic Center of St. Louis
Exhibit E:	Barnes-Jewish West County MRI

Employer submitted the following exhibits for hearing:

Exhibit 1:	Deposition of Dr. Haupt taken on October 20, 2005
Exhibit 2:	Deposition of Dr. Zehnder taken on October 25, 2005

- Exhibit 3: Deposition of Dr. Emanuel taken on September 26, 2005
Exhibit 4: Medical Records of BJC
Exhibit 5: Functional Capacity by Evaluation Records

FINDINGS OF FACT

1. Claimant, being born on December 8, 1942, was 66 years of age at the time of hearing. Claimant worked for TWA/American Airlines for 36 years as a flight service manager.
2. On June 15, 2003, Claimant, while standing next to a cockpit door, was struck in the arm by a door that was opened by the pilot, injuring her right shoulder and arm. This occurred in Austin, Texas. On the same day, while still working, Claimant was behind a door when the pilot opened the door several times. Claimant's shoulder was pinched in the bi-fold door. The second injury was later in the day in Saint Louis, Missouri.
3. Claimant informed her supervisor of the incidents and that she had problems with her right arm and right elbow. Claimant went for treatment at BarnesCare on June 18, 2003, for pain in the right elbow and right shoulder. BarnesCare placed her on restrictions, gave her physical therapy, and prescribed medication. BarnesCare ordered an MRI and Claimant was sent to Dr. Haupt for treatment.
4. The MRI on her right shoulder showed that she had small/moderate complete rotator cuff tears, a small/moderate amount of fluid in the joint space freely communicating with the adjacent bursa, and moderate acromioclavicular osteoarthritis.
5. On September 24, 2003, Dr. Haupt performed surgery on Claimant's right shoulder and an arthroscopic intraarticular debridement of partial thickness rotator cuff tear, and excision of the CA ligament and distal clavicle excision.
6. After surgery, Dr. Haupt had her follow up with physical therapy and tried to increase her activities.
7. Dr. Haupt released Claimant in 2003. He did not think Claimant could return to her previous work as a flight attendant with lifting and pushing involved unless someone was there to help her.
8. Claimant, after being released by Dr. Haupt, went to see Dr. James Walentynowicz who diagnosed her with ongoing adhesive capsulitis and recommended re-manipulation of the shoulder.
9. Claimant was next seen by Dr. Zhender who after examining her felt that she was at maximum medical improvement and needed no further treatment.
10. Claimant went on her own to see Dr. Mark Miller who felt that she had a postoperative frozen shoulder. He ordered an MRI Arthrogram, which was completed on September 20, 2004. Dr. Miller, after reviewing the MRI, felt Claimant had partial thickness rotator cuff tears that were damaged enough that there would likely be some permanent

weakness. He opined Claimant could be treated conservatively and a repeat diagnostic arthroscopy to reassess the shoulder should be considered.

11. Claimant next went to see Dr. James Emanuel on January 18, 2005, who diagnosed her with right shoulder pain, partial thickness rotator cuff tear, with possible focal full thickness rotator cuff tear, early degeneration of the glenohumeral joint, status post arthroscopic debridement of glenoid labrum and rotator cuff tear. He was of the opinion she had mild cubital tunnel syndrome of the right elbow. He felt that Claimant could either be treated conservatively or surgically.
12. Claimant was seen by Dr. David Volarich on behalf of Claimant's attorney . He found that as a result of her injury on June 15, 2003, Claimant had right shoulder internal derangement, S/P arthroscopic subacromial decompression, excision of the coracoacromial ligament, acromioplasty, distal clavicle excision as well as debridement of the labrum and partial thickness rotator cuff tear. He opined she had a postoperative adhesive capsulitis right shoulder, right shoulder girdle myofascial pain syndrome and right elbow medial epicondylitis with mil ulnar neuritis. He felt that Claimant's injury caused a 50% permanent partial disability of the right extremity at the shoulder as well as 20% permanent partial disability of the right upper extremity at the elbow due to a contusion. Dr. Volarich testified very credibly that Claimant is at maximum medical improvement and is not in need of future medical care.
13. Claimant testified very credibly that she had worked for Employer for over 30 years and that her last day of work was June 15, 2003. She has been unable to return to work as a flight attendant as a result of the injury. Claimant is right arm dominant and feels that she can't use it because it is very sensitive to touch. She has lost strength and cannot hold anything. She drops things with great frequency. She claims that because of the pain in her right upper extremity she is in so much pain that she has at times passed out. She also has tingling in her elbow. Claimant claims as a result of the injury she is unable to sleep, finds it hard to dress, drive, and cook, among other things.
14. I have reviewed all of the evidence presented, including the testimony of Paul Ceresia, a witness for Claimant. He testified Claimant was an excellent worker for the airline. She had at one time been his supervisor. He feels that as a result of the injury she sustained she is in a great deal of pain and has become isolated.

RULINGS OF LAW

1. Claimant sustained, as a result of the accident on June 15, 2003, a 40% permanent partial disability of the right shoulder at the 232 week level for 92.8 weeks at \$340.12 a week for a total of \$31,563.14 as compensation for permanent partial disability.
2. Claimant will not benefit from and is not entitled to any future medical care.

Date: _____

Made by: _____

Cornelius T. Lane
Administrative Law Judge
Division of Workers' Compensation

A true copy: Attest:

Naomi Pearson
Division of Workers' Compensation